

CHANNEL ISLANDS NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting

Friday, November 15, 2019
Poinsettia Pavilion
3451 Foothill Road, Ventura, CA 93003

FINAL Key Meeting Outcomes

Administrative Business and Announcements

Nineteen representatives attended the November meeting representing 16 voting seats (see Appendix 1). Public attendance included approximately 20 individuals in the morning, and three in the afternoon. Council Chair Phyllis Grifman called the meeting to order.

Recognizing Incoming Members

After role was called, council Chair Grifman announced CDR Justin Noggle of the US Coast Guard as the new USCG seat member CDR Noggle introduced himself to the council.

May 17, 2019 Draft Key Outcomes

The council unanimously voted to approve the draft key outcomes from the July 19, 2019 meeting. Copies of these documents are available upon request from pike.spector@noaa.gov. They will also be posted on the Sanctuary's website.

Sanctuary Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Chris Mobley began his report by describing a recent, west coast sanctuary-wide deep-sea coral initiative. Mobley acknowledged CINMS contractor Lizzie Duncan, who sailed aboard NOAA's r/v *Rueben-Lasker* for two legs of the 30-day multi-agency Expanding Pacific Research and Exploration of Submerged Systems (EXPRESS) cruise and coordinated the expedition live-dive outreach program. Mobley then acknowledged CINMS's participation in the 2019 Coastal Cleanup beach cleanup, coordinated by CINMS intern and UCSB Bren School masters student Laura Ingulsrud. In total, 2300lbs of trash was collected by CINMS staff, volunteers, and local lobster fisherman from Santa Cruz Island. The superintendent's report was rounded out by a description of eelgrass habitat surveys conducted on Anacapa Island, and recent giant black sea bass and soundscape monitoring conducted by CINMS staff around Santa Barbara Island.

Council Member Brief Announcements

Council members shared news and announcements about recent events unrelated to the meeting agenda. Audio recordings are available upon request from pike.spector@noaa.gov

Management Plan Update Process – Part 1: Review of public scoping process and comments
(slides available upon request)

Deputy Superintendent Michael Murray introduced CINMS Management Plan specialist Shawn Choy (on detail from NOAA's National Ocean Service) who provided an overview of the public scoping process and a synopsis of public comments. Mr. Choy began his presentation by thanking the council for their help with the two public scoping meetings that took place in October 2019, and noted the council's role in the overall Management Plan Revision (MPR) process. Mr. Choy detailed an outline of the MPR process timeline, including the integration of public comments.

Mr. Choy then gave an overview of the public scoping process, and a summary of comments received. Comments were collected in person during two public meetings, and online and via email during the public scoping period (October 1st – November 15th, 2019). Overall, 213 comments were received; 169 oral comments, 40 online comments, two from comment forms (at public meetings), and two via traditional mail were received. Additional comments are expected to arrive before the midnight deadline on November 15. From a programmatic perspective, in descending order, Mr. Choy explained that the majority of comments received related to resource protection and associated regulations, resource protection programs, education and outreach, research and monitoring, operations and vessel use, and access and compatible use issues. The majority of topics covered had to do with marine protected area boundaries, climate change and ocean acidification, oil and gas exploration, whales and shipping, and the dissemination of sanctuary information and programs to the general public.

Mr. Choy concluded with a recap of the presentation that Superintendent Mobley had given during the October public scoping meetings, including highlights from the 2016 Condition report, as well as general sanctuary statistics and program area descriptions. Mr. Choy noted that the new sanctuary condition report is the “gold standard” of condition reports moving forward for NOAA’s Office of National Marine Sanctuaries. This presentation also included a brief overview of the management plan itself, and (from the national office), why the MPR is an important process. Mr. Choy then went on to describe the necessity of public scoping, the efficacy of scoping comments, and concluded with topics for consideration for the council as they prepared to develop advisory council scoping comments. A lively question and answering session with the council followed.

Public Comment Period (#1 of 2)

No comments.

Presentation: Ocean Acidification Refugia at the Northern Channel Islands *slides available upon request

On behalf of Lydia Kapsenberg, a former UC Santa Barbara PhD student and current Marie Curie Postdoctoral fellow at the Institute of Marine Sciences in Barcelona, Spain, current Sea Grant fellow Pike Spector presented work published by Dr. Kapsenberg. While working towards her PhD, Dr. Kapsenberg studied sea water chemistry around the Santa Barbara Channel and the northern Channel Islands. According to her findings, the northern Channel Islands are less likely to be impacted by the effects of Ocean Acidification due to reduced upwelling. Pike, who is working on a webstory about this work for NOAA’s Office of National Marine Sanctuaries, presented this concept of an “Ocean Acidification refuge” to the council. While upwelling along the coast of California brings nutrients from deep water to the surface, thus facilitating a proliferation of productivity at the base of marine food webs, it also brings water that is lower in pH to the surface. Coupled with deleterious drops in pH from excess atmospheric carbon dioxide, areas of the ocean that are exposed to large upwelling pulses can see synergistic drops in pH that can devastate marine life. While the northern Channel Islands will not be exempt from the threat of ocean acidification, reduced upwelling will likely make the islands a refuge for neighboring coastal communities north and south of Point Conception. A lively question and answering session followed Pike’s presentation.

Management Plan Revision Process – Part 2: Council Scoping Comment

Deputy superintendent Mike Murray introduced the topic, and Superintendent Chris Mobley reiterated the seriousness of council scoping comment input. To facilitate the process, Chair Grifman called on each council member present to share suggested scoping comments. Two lists were created to be attached to a council scoping comment letter; one appendix to contain all

consensus-based comments, and a second appendix to contain all non-consensus based council comments. As comments were suggested, the council engaged in discourse to understand various perspective, and to suggest modifications that resulted in great levels of full consensus among participating members.

Public Comment Period (#2 of 2)

Mr. Eric Kramer, a local commercial groundfish fisherman and recreational fisherman, commented that the SAC is the best liaison for ensuring that the general public gets an opportunity to provide input to the federal government. Specifically, Mr. Kramer advocated for the reevaluation of the Channel Island marine protected areas.

Management Plan Revision Process – Part 3: Adoption of Council Scoping Comment Letter

After a brief break, Council Chair Grifman allowed for final adjustments to be made to the final scoping comments that members had suggested. A motion was made and seconded to officially adopt the member-suggested scoping comments on behalf of the council, and a cover letter to be used to transmit the comments. The voice vote resulted in unanimous approval, with none opposed and none abstaining. [A copy of the council’s approved letter, including the voting record supporting its approval, is found online as part of the official public scoping comments archived through the regulations.gov website. ([Link to letter](#))]

Working Group Reports

In the interest of time, the Chair Grifman had requested earlier that working group reports should be provided during member brief announcements at the beginning of the meeting

Meeting Close Out

Council Chair Phyllis Grifman called attention to the 2020 schedule, thanked everyone for attending, and closed the meeting out. The 2020 meeting schedule:

- Friday, January 24, 2020 – Santa Barbara Zoo
- Friday, March 20, 2020 -- Ventura
- Friday, May 15, 2020 – Santa Barbara
- Friday, July 17, 2020 -- Oxnard or Ventura
- Friday, September 18, 2020 – Santa Barbara
- Friday, November 20, 2020 -- Ventura

Meeting adjourned

APPENDIX 1: Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting Attendance Roster for Nov. 15, 2019

| Name | Advisory Council Seat | Attendance |
|-------------------|---|-------------------|
| Andrea Mills | Tourism | Present |
| Morgan Coffey | Tourism - Alternate | Absent |
| Ben Pitterle | Non-Consumptive Recreation | Present |
| Dr. Tony Knight | Non-Consumptive Recreation - Alternate | Absent |
| Michael Cohen | Business | Present |
| Capt. Kip Louttit | Business - Alternate | Present |
| Kristen Hislop | Conservation | Present |
| Greg Helms | Conservation - Alternate | Present |
| Stephanie Mutz | Commercial Fishing | Present |
| John Hoadley | Commercial Fishing - Alternate | Absent |
| Capt. David Bacon | Recreational Fishing | Present |
| Merit McCrea | Recreational Fishing - Alternate | Absent |
| Cliff Rodrigues | Education | Present |
| <vacant> | Education - Alternate | |
| Dr. Robert Warner | Research | Absent |
| Dr. Mark Steele | Research - Alternate | Absent |
| Phyllis Grifman | Public at Large #1 | Present |
| Judy Willens | Public at Large #1 - Alternate | Present |
| Richard Block | Public at Large #2 | Absent |
| Mary Byrd | Public at Large #2 - Alternate | Absent |
| Luhui Isha Waiya | Chumash Community | Absent |
| Alicia Cordero | Chumash Community - Alternate | Present |
| Laura McCue | NOAA Fisheries | Absent |
| <vacant> | NOAA Fisheries - Alternate | |
| <vacant> | National Park Service | |
| Ken Convery | National Park Service - Alternate | Present |
| CDR Jason Noggle | US Coast Guard | Present |
| LCDR Less Crusius | US Coast Guard - Alternate | Absent |
| Donna Schroeder | Bureau of Ocean Energy Management | Present |
| Jeremy Potter | Bureau of Ocean Energy Management -Alternate | Absent |
| Walt Schobel | Dept. of Defense | Present |
| Greg Sanders | Dept. of Defense - Alternate | Present |
| Carlos Mireles | California Dept. of Fish & Wildlife | Absent |
| John Ugoretz | California Dept. of Fish & Wildlife - Alternate | Absent |
| Jenn Eckerle | California Natural Resources Agency | Absent |
| Paige Berube | California Natural Resources Agency – Alternate | Absent |
| Dr. Jonna Engel | California Coastal Commission | Absent |
| Jacqueline Phelps | California Coastal Commission - Alternate | Present |
| Errin Briggs | Santa Barbara County | Absent |
| David Villalobos | Santa Barbara County - Alternate | Absent |
| Danielle Tarr | Ventura County | Present |
| Mark Sandoval | Ventura County - Alternate | Absent |
| Chris Mobley | Channel Islands NMS [non-voting] | Present |
| Mike Murray | Channel Islands NMS – Alternate [non-voting] | Present |
| Paul Michel | Monterey Bay NMS [non-voting] | Absent |
| Karen Grimmer | Monterey Bay NMS - Alternate [non-voting] | Absent |
| Maria Brown | Greater Farallones NMS [non-voting] | Absent |
| Brian Johnson | Greater Farallones NMS – Alternate [non-voting] | Absent |

